



Exploring the Efficacy of Collaborative Professional Learning Communities in Enhancing ESL Teaching Practices

¹Ramila Ahmad, ²Shah Faisal*, ³Haleema Rouf

¹MPhil English, Department of English Literature and Linguistics, Northern University Nowshera
ram.awaan@gmail.com

²MPhil Scholar, Department of English Literature and Linguistics, Northern University Nowshera
shahfaisaluom@gmail.com

³BS Student at Government Degree College Batkhela, affiliated with the University of Malakand

Article Info

Article History:

Received 14 Nov 2023

Revised 24 Nov 2023

Accepted 17 Dec 2023

*Corresponding author: (S. Faisal)

shahfaisaluom@gmail.com

Keywords:

Collaborative Professional Learning Communities,
ESL teaching practices,
Professional Development,
Cultural Relevance,
Student Learning Outcomes

Abstract

This study explores the impact of Collaborative Professional Learning Communities (CPLCs) on ESL teaching practices in the context of Lahore, Pakistan. Eighteen ESL teachers participated in semi-structured interviews, providing insights into the influence of CPLCs on pedagogical strategies, cultural relevance, professional growth, and student outcomes. Results indicate that CPLCs play a pivotal role in enhancing ESL teaching practices by facilitating the exchange of innovative ideas, addressing cultural nuances, and fostering professional support. Notably, the study identifies a positive correlation between CPLC participation and improved student learning outcomes. The findings contribute to the broader discourse on the transformative potential of collaborative communities in ESL education, emphasizing the need for sustained efforts to overcome implementation challenges. As educators seek dynamic approaches to meet the diverse linguistic and cultural needs of ESL learners, CPLCs emerge as integral hubs for fostering collaborative learning environments that positively impact both educators and students in the dynamic educational landscape of Lahore, Pakistan.

Introduction

Teacher professional development is of utmost importance in education as it serves as a catalyst for continuous improvement in teaching practices (Akram et al., 2022). Recognizing the broader implications for educational practices and policies (Akram & Yang, 2021; Akram 2020), ongoing training and exposure to innovative pedagogies, educators can enhance their teaching skills, adapt to diverse student needs, and stay abreast of technological advancements (Abdelrady & Akram, 2022). Professional development also plays a crucial role in fostering a culture of lifelong learning among teachers, boosting their confidence, job satisfaction, and overall effectiveness in the classroom (Hammad et al., 2021; Akram et al., 2021). Furthermore, it ensures alignment with evolving educational trends and standards, promoting a dynamic and relevant educational experience for students. Ultimately, the impact of teacher professional development extends beyond individual classrooms, contributing to improved student outcomes and creating a supportive community where educators collaboratively strive for educational excellence (Al-Adwan et al., 2022).

Over the past decade, the landscape of education has undergone a notable transformation marked by a discernible shift towards collaborative methodologies (Aslam et al., 2021; Gutierrez, 2015). Scholars and educators

alike have increasingly emphasized the pivotal role of continuous professional development as a cornerstone for effective teaching (DeLuca et al., 2017; Balyer et al., 2015). In response to this paradigm shift, Collaborative Professional Learning Communities (CPLCs) have ascended to prominence as crucial forums for educators aspiring to elevate their teaching practices (Olin, et al., 2020). Against this backdrop, the current study seeks to intricately examine and evaluate the effectiveness of CPLCs, focusing with precision on their impact within the domain of English as a Second Language (ESL) instruction. As the educational community continues to embrace collaborative paradigms, this research endeavors to contribute nuanced insights into the specific efficacy of CPLCs in enhancing ESL teaching practices, thereby advancing our understanding of the evolving dynamics within contemporary educational frameworks.

ESL teaching presents unique challenges and opportunities due to the diverse linguistic and cultural backgrounds of learners (Akram et al., 2020). Navigating this diversity requires educators to employ adaptive teaching strategies that not only facilitate language acquisition but also embrace the cultural nuances embedded within the learning process (Colmer, 2017). Recognizing the need for continual professional development to meet these multifaceted demands, the educational landscape has increasingly turned towards collaborative approaches as a means of enhancing ESL instruction. The integration of collaborative learning environments into ESL professional development initiatives holds promise for addressing these challenges. CPLCs, characterized by shared goals, mutual support, and collaborative inquiry, provide a platform for educators to collaboratively reflect on, refine, and advance their teaching practices (Trabona, et al., 2019).

The rationale for this research lies in the recognition that the traditional model of isolated professional development may not fully capitalize on the collective expertise within the teaching community. By delving into the dynamics of collaborative learning, this study seeks to unveil how ESL educators benefit from the collective wisdom of their peers. The exchange of ideas, resources, and best practices within CPLCs has the potential to foster a rich professional growth environment.

The investigation will encompass a comprehensive examination of various aspects, including the structure and functioning of CPLCs, the nature of collaborative interactions, and the perceived impact on ESL teaching practices.

Furthermore, this research aligns with broader educational objectives of fostering continuous improvement and innovation within ESL instruction. As educators navigate the complexities of adapting to diverse learner needs, understanding the role of collaborative professional learning becomes paramount. The findings of this study are anticipated to contribute valuable insights to educational policymakers, school administrators, and ESL educators alike, facilitating informed decisions regarding the integration and optimization of collaborative learning communities for the enhancement of ESL teaching practices.

Research questions

1. How do Collaborative Professional Learning Communities (CPLCs) influence ESL teaching practices among educators in Lahore, Pakistan?
2. To what extent do ESL educators perceive the impact of participation in Collaborative Professional Learning Communities on their instructional strategies, classroom management, and overall effectiveness in addressing the diverse linguistic and cultural needs of ESL learners?

Review of Literature

The concept of Collaborative Professional Learning Communities (CPLCs) has evolved significantly since the foundational work of DuFour and Eaker (1998), highlighting the inherent collaborative nature of teaching as a means for continuous improvement. Originally conceived as Professional Learning Communities (PLCs), the idea has undergone refinement and expansion to emphasize the collaborative aspect more prominently (Bleicher, 2014). These communities represent dynamic spaces where educators collaboratively engage in a systematic process of collective inquiry, reflection, and action to enhance teaching practices and, by extension, student learning outcomes (Schnellert & Butler, 2021). The evolution of CPLCs reflects a shift from isolated professional development to a more holistic, community-driven approach, acknowledging that the collective wisdom and shared experiences of educators

contribute profoundly to the overall improvement of teaching strategies and methodologies. As the educational landscape continues to evolve, the collaborative essence of CPLCs remains at the forefront, guiding educators toward a collective pursuit of excellence and adaptability in the face of changing educational paradigms.

Research by Wood et al. (2017) indicates the positive impact of collaborative learning environments on pedagogical strategies. CPLCs serve as platforms for educators to share best practices, innovative teaching methods, and resources, contributing to their professional growth. Cultural relevance is crucial in ESL instruction (Coates, 2016). Collaborative discussions within CPLCs, as highlighted by Dritis-Esser and Stark (2015) enhance cultural responsiveness by tailoring teaching materials to local contexts. This aspect gains significance in diverse educational settings such as Lahore, with its pronounced linguistic and cultural diversity. Ramzan and Khan (2019) have suggested that stereotyped ideological constructions are enhanced by nawabs in Baluchistan. Further, Ramzan et al. (2021) have indicated that there is a manipulation and exploitation of the public in the hands of politicians and powerful people. Khan et al. (2017) have expressed that print media acts as a tool in the hands of capitalists. Bhutto and Ramzan (2021) have claimed that there is a collusive stance and pacifier agenda of media wrapped in the strategy of power. Nawaz et al. (2021) have said that power is striving for negative them and positive us. Ramzan et al. (2023) have elucidated that motivational factors influence the language learning strategies e.g. memory, cognition and social effects. Than Ramzan et al. (2023) have said that grammar has practical benefits as well as it has cultural and social importance. After that, Ramzan et al. (2023) have claimed that students' academic motivation can be enhanced by using significant contribution of social media.

Professional growth and support within CPLCs have been underscored by research (Joh Deppeler, 2007). The collaborative environment fosters mentorship, shared experiences, and a collective commitment to continuous improvement, creating a supportive professional community.

Addressing challenges in implementing effective CPLCs, as identified by McConnell et al. (2013), is crucial. Time constraints and varying levels of commitment among participants are common impediments that need to be overcome to optimize the potential benefits of collaborative learning communities. Recent studies, such as that by Lysberg (2023), suggest a positive correlation between teacher collaboration within CPLCs and improved student learning outcomes. Understanding this link is essential for evaluating the holistic impact of CPLCs on ESL education.

While existing literature provides a global perspective on the impact of CPLCs in diverse contexts, there is a noticeable gap in research specific to Lahore, Pakistan. This study aims to contribute by exploring the applicability and effectiveness of CPLCs within the unique linguistic and cultural landscape of ESL education in Lahore. Understanding the nuances of CPLCs in this specific setting is crucial for advancing ESL education and fostering collaborative learning environments aligned with the diverse needs of ESL learners in Lahore.

Methodology

Participants

Eighteen school teachers from various educational institutions in Lahore, Pakistan, voluntarily participated in this research. The participants were purposefully selected to ensure a diverse representation of ESL educators with varying levels of experience, teaching contexts, and linguistic backgrounds.

Data Collection

Semi-structured interviews were employed as the primary method of data collection. The interviews, conducted in person, aimed to gather in-depth insights into the experiences and perspectives of ESL teachers regarding their involvement in Collaborative Professional Learning Communities (CPLCs). The interview questions were designed to explore participants' perceptions of the impact of CPLCs on their teaching practices, the collaborative mechanisms at play, and the perceived benefits and challenges within the Lahore context.

Procedure

Prior to conducting the interviews, ethical approval was obtained from the relevant institutional review board. Informed consent was secured from each participant, emphasizing the voluntary nature of their participation and the confidentiality of their responses. The interviews were conducted in a conversational manner, allowing participants to

share their experiences openly. Probing questions were used to elicit detailed responses, ensuring a comprehensive understanding of the dynamics of CPLCs in the context of ESL teaching in Lahore.

Data Analysis

Thematic analysis was employed to identify patterns, recurring themes, and key insights from the interview data. The recorded interviews were transcribed verbatim, and the transcripts were systematically coded to categorize responses into overarching themes. The analysis aimed to capture both commonalities and unique perspectives among the participants, providing a rich and nuanced portrayal of the impact of CPLCs on ESL teaching practices in Lahore.

Validity and Reliability

To enhance the validity of the study, member checking was employed, allowing participants to review and confirm the accuracy of their interview transcripts. Additionally, intercoder reliability was ensured by having two researchers independently code a subset of the data, with any discrepancies resolved through discussion.

Limitations

While efforts were made to ensure diversity among participants, the study's findings may be specific to the context of Lahore and may not be universally applicable. The sample size, though sufficient for qualitative analysis, may limit the generalizability of the results. Moreover, the study's reliance on self-reported experiences introduces the potential for social desirability bias.

Results

The analysis of interviews with eighteen ESL teachers in Lahore revealed multifaceted insights into the impact of Collaborative Professional Learning Communities (CPLCs) on teaching practices. Several key themes emerged from the data, highlighting the diverse experiences and perspectives of educators participating in these collaborative communities.

Enhanced Pedagogical Strategies

A recurrent theme among participants was the perceived enhancement of pedagogical strategies through CPLC engagement. Teachers expressed that collaborative discussions facilitated the exchange of innovative teaching methods, resource sharing, and a collective problem-solving approach, leading to a more dynamic and effective ESL instructional framework. As per some teachers:

Teacher A: "In our CPLC, we discussed using technology to make grammar lessons more interactive. I implemented it, and the students loved it. It's amazing how these collaborative ideas can transform our teaching methods."

Teacher B: "We share lesson plans and activities. It's not just about textbooks; it's about adapting to our students' needs. Collaborating with others has opened my eyes to so many creative approaches."

Cultural Relevance and Contextualization

Participants emphasized the significance of CPLCs in addressing the unique linguistic and cultural needs of ESL learners in Lahore. Collaborative interactions were instrumental in developing culturally relevant teaching materials and adapting instructional strategies to resonate with the diverse backgrounds of students, fostering a more inclusive learning environment. Few teachers stated:

Teacher C: "I teach students from diverse backgrounds. The CPLC discussions helped me understand the cultural nuances, and together we've developed materials that resonate with our students. It's about making ESL education culturally inclusive."

Teacher D: "Being able to discuss and tailor content to our local context is crucial. It's not a one-size-fits-all approach. We share ideas on how to make lessons culturally relevant, and it makes a significant difference in how students connect with the material."

Professional Growth and Support

The majority of teachers reported a sense of professional growth and support derived from their participation in CPLCs. The collaborative nature of these communities provided a platform for mentorship, mutual encouragement, and a shared commitment to continuous improvement. Educators felt more empowered and motivated in their roles as ESL instructors. As per some teachers:

Teacher E: "It's like having a support system. When facing challenges, we discuss it in our group. The collaborative support makes the profession less isolating. I feel more motivated and valued as an ESL educator."

Teacher F: "We have veteran teachers in our CPLC who share their experiences. It's like having mentors, and it makes a difference, especially for newer teachers. The encouragement and advice are invaluable."

Challenges in Implementation

Despite the overall positive perceptions, challenges in the implementation of CPLCs were acknowledged. Time constraints, logistical issues, and varying levels of commitment among participants were identified as impediments to the seamless functioning of these collaborative communities. Overcoming these challenges emerged as a crucial aspect for maximizing the potential benefits of CPLCs. As per some teachers:

Teacher G: "Time is a challenge; we're all so busy. Coordinating schedules can be tricky, but when we manage to meet, the discussions are so beneficial. It's about finding that balance."

Teacher H: "Getting everyone on the same page can be tough. Some are more committed than others. We're working on strategies to keep everyone engaged and committed to the collaborative process."

Impact on Student Learning Outcomes

Teachers noted a positive correlation between their involvement in CPLCs and improvements in student learning outcomes. The application of collaborative insights in the classroom was associated with increased student engagement, better language acquisition, and a more supportive learning environment for ESL learners. Few teachers stated:

Teacher I: "I noticed a change in my students' participation and understanding. The collaborative ideas we implement really resonate with them. It's not just about what we teach; it's about how they learn."

Teacher J: "When we align our teaching strategies through collaboration, the students benefit. They're more engaged, and I've seen improvements in their language skills. It's rewarding to see that direct impact."

The results of this study suggest that Collaborative Professional Learning Communities play a pivotal role in enhancing ESL teaching practices in Lahore. The positive impact on pedagogical strategies, cultural relevance, professional growth, and student outcomes underscores the value of collaborative initiatives in the professional development of ESL educators. While challenges exist, the overall findings advocate for the continued exploration and promotion of CPLCs as a means to enrich the quality of ESL instruction in diverse educational contexts like Lahore, Pakistan.

Discussion

The findings of this study align with and contribute to the existing body of literature on Collaborative Professional Learning Communities (CPLCs) and their impact on ESL teaching practices. Comparisons with previous studies reveal both consistencies and unique insights, enriching our understanding of the role of collaborative learning environments in diverse educational contexts.

The observed enhancement of pedagogical strategies through CPLCs resonates with prior research (DeLuca et al., 2017; Balyer et al., 2015). The collaborative exchange of innovative teaching methods and resources emerges as a common thread, emphasizing the universal applicability of collaborative communities in fostering dynamic instructional frameworks.

The emphasis on cultural relevance and contextualization echoes the work of (Coates, 2016) who found that collaborative discussions contribute to culturally responsive teaching. The study's participants similarly recognized the importance of adapting ESL instruction to the unique linguistic and cultural needs of students in Lahore.

The theme of professional growth and support aligns with the findings of studies by (Trabona, et al., 2019). The collaborative nature of these communities provides a sense of camaraderie and mentorship, positively impacting ESL educators' professional identities and motivation.

Challenges in implementation identified in this study, such as time constraints and varying levels of commitment, echo concerns raised by Olin et al. (2017). Addressing these challenges becomes imperative for optimizing the effectiveness of CPLCs, aligning with the broader literature emphasizing the need for sustained commitment.

Unique Insights and Contributions

The specific context of Lahore, Pakistan, introduces nuances that distinguish this study's findings. The emphasis on adapting teaching materials to local cultural contexts is a notable contribution, emphasizing the significance of CPLCs in promoting culturally inclusive ESL education in regions characterized by diverse linguistic backgrounds.

The positive correlation between CPLC participation and improved student learning outcomes aligns with but extends beyond existing literature. While previous studies often focused on teacher-centric outcomes, our findings suggest a direct impact on the quality of ESL education and student engagement, adding a valuable dimension to the discussion.

The study's results have practical implications for ESL educators, school administrators, and policymakers in Lahore. The identified benefits underscore the importance of fostering and sustaining CPLCs as integral components of professional development initiatives. Strategies to overcome implementation challenges should be explored, ensuring the longevity and effectiveness of these collaborative communities.

Future research could delve deeper into the specific mechanisms within CPLCs that contribute to enhanced student outcomes. Additionally, comparative studies across different cultural and educational contexts would provide a more comprehensive understanding of the universal and context-specific aspects of CPLCs.

Conclusions

In conclusion, this study illuminates the transformative potential of Collaborative Professional Learning Communities (CPLCs) in the context of ESL education in Lahore, Pakistan. The findings underscore the positive impact of CPLCs on ESL teaching practices, revealing their pivotal role in enhancing pedagogical strategies, addressing cultural nuances, fostering professional growth, and positively influencing student learning outcomes. The collaborative nature of these communities proves instrumental in creating a dynamic and supportive environment for ESL educators, facilitating the exchange of innovative ideas and practices that resonate with the diverse linguistic and cultural backgrounds of learners in Lahore.

Furthermore, this study contributes to the broader discourse by emphasizing the need for sustained efforts in overcoming implementation challenges, such as time constraints and varying levels of commitment. The insights gleaned from this research offer practical implications for ESL educators, school administrators, and policymakers, highlighting the importance of fostering and optimizing CPLCs as integral components of professional development initiatives. As we navigate the dynamic landscape of ESL education, the study's implications extend beyond Lahore, providing valuable considerations for educators globally who seek collaborative avenues to enhance their teaching practices and, ultimately, improve the quality of ESL instruction for diverse learner populations.

References

- Abdelrady, A. H., & Akram, H. (2022). An empirical study of ClassPoint tool application in enhancing EFL students' online learning satisfaction. *Systems, 10*(5), 154.
- Akram, H., Raza, M., Jan, M. F., Aslam, S., & Nivin-Vargas, L. (2022). Identified leadership practices and teachers' professional development in Karachi, Pakistan: the moderation effect of training. *Education 3-13, 1-18*.
- Akram, H., & Yang, Y. (2021). A critical analysis of the weak implementation causes on educational policies in Pakistan. *International Journal of Humanities and Innovation (IJHI), 4*(1), 25-28.
- Akram, H. (2020). Education governance in Pakistan: A critical analysis of challenges. *Journal of Social Sciences Advancement, 1*(1), 38-41.
- Akram, H., Yang, Y., Ahmad, N., & Aslam, S. (2020). Factors Contributing Low English Language Literacy in Rural Primary Schools of Karachi, Pakistan. *International Journal of English Linguistics, 10*(6), 335-346.
- Akram, H., Yingxiu, Y., Al-Adwan, A. S., & Alkhalifah, A. (2021). Technology integration in higher education during COVID-19: An assessment of online teaching competencies through technological pedagogical content knowledge model. *Frontiers in psychology, 12*, 736522.

- Al-Adwan, A. S., Nofal, M., Akram, H., Albelbisi, N. A., & Al-Okaily, M. (2022). Towards a Sustainable Adoption of E-Learning Systems: The Role of Self-Directed Learning. *Journal of Information Technology Education: Research*, 21.
- Aslam, S., Akram, H., Saleem, A., & Zhang, B. (2021). Experiences of international medical students enrolled in Chinese medical institutions towards online teaching during the COVID-19 pandemic. *PeerJ*, 9, e12061.
- Balyer, A., Karatas, H., & Alci, B. (2015). School principals' roles in establishing collaborative professional learning communities at schools. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 197, 1340-1347.
- Bhutto, J., and Ramzan. M. (2021). "ENGLISH: Verses of Quran, Gender Issues, Feminine Injustice, and Media Transmission - CDA of Pakistani Press Reports. *Rahatulquloob* 5 (2), 111-26.
<https://doi.org/10.51411/rahat.5.2.2021/316>
- Bleicher, R. E. (2014). A collaborative action research approach to professional learning. *Professional development in education*, 40(5), 802-821.
- Coates, P. W. (2016). To build a culturally sensitive educator: A clinical model highlighting the importance of innovative ESL strategies in early field placement classes teaching ELL middle level students. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 6(3), 445.
- Colmer, K. (2017). Collaborative professional learning: Contributing to the growth of leadership, professional identity and professionalism. *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal*, 25(3), 436-449.
- DeLuca, C., Bolden, B., & Chan, J. (2017). Systemic professional learning through collaborative inquiry: Examining teachers' perspectives. *Teaching and teacher education*, 67, 67-78.
- Deppeler, J. (2007). Collaborative inquiry for professional learning. In *Dimensions of professional learning* (pp. 73-87). Brill.
- Drits-Esser, D., & Stark, L. A. (2015). The impact of collaborative curriculum design on teacher professional learning. *The electronic journal of science education*, 19(8).
- DuFour, R., & Eaker, R. (1998). Professional learning communities. *Bloomington, IN: National Educational Service*, 230.
- Gutierrez, S. B. (2015). Collaborative professional learning through lesson study: Identifying the challenges of inquiry-based teaching. *Issues in Educational Research*, 25(2), 118-134.
- Hammad, W., Abu Shindi, Y., Morad, H., Al-Mahdy, Y. F. H., & Al-Harhi, K. (2021). Promoting teacher professional learning in Egyptian schools: the contribution of learning-centered leadership. *International Journal of Leadership in Education*, 1-19.
- Khan, M.A., Ramzan, M.M., Dar, S R.(2017) Deconstruction of Ideological Discursivity in Pakistani Print Media Advertisements from CDA Perspective Erevna: The Journal of Linguistics and Literature,1(1),56-79.
- Lysberg, J. (2023). Unpacking capabilities for professional learning: teachers' reflections on processes of collaborative inquiry in situated teamwork. *Journal of Workplace Learning*, 35(1), 1-16.
- McConnell, T. J., Parker, J. M., Eberhardt, J., Koehler, M. J., & Lundeberg, M. A. (2013). Virtual professional learning communities: Teachers' perceptions of virtual versus face-to-face professional development. *Journal of science education and technology*, 22, 267-277.
- Nawaz, S., Aqeel, M., Ramzan, M., Rehman, M., Tanoli, Z.A., (2021). Language Representation and Ideological Stance of Brahui in Comparison with Urdu and English Newspapers Headlines, *Harf-O-Sukhan*, 5(4) ,267-293.
- Ramzan, M., Khan, M.A., (2019).CDA of Baluchistan Newspapers Headlines- A Study of Nawabs' Stereotyped Ideological Constructions. *Annual Research Journal 'Hankén'*, XI, 27-41.
- Ramzan, M. Qureshi, A.B., Samad, A. Sultan, N. (2021) Politics as Rhetoric: A Discourse Analysis of Selected Pakistani Politicians Press Statements. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*, 9(3) ,1063-1070
- Ramzan, M. et al. (2020) Comparative Pragmatic Study of Print Media Discourse in Baluchistan Newspapers headlines, *Al-Burz*, Volume 12, Issue 0

- Ramzan, M., Oteir, I., Khan, M. A., Al-Otaibi, A., & Malik, S. (2023). English learning motivation of ESL learners from ethnic, gender, and cultural perspectives in sustainable development goals. *International Journal of English Language and Literature Studies*, 12(3), 195-212.
- Ramzan, M., Azmat, Z., Khan, M.A., & Nisa, Z. un. (2023). Subject-Verb Agreement Errors in ESL Students' Academic Writing: A Surface Taxonomy Approach. *Linguistic Forum - A Journal of Linguistics*, 5(2), 16–21. <https://doi.org/10.53057/linfo/2023.5.2.3>
- Ramzan, M., Bibi, R., & Khunsa, N. (2023). Unraveling the Link between Social Media Usage and Academic Achievement among ESL Learners: A Quantitative Analysis. *Global. Educational Studies Review*, VIII(II), 407-421. [https://doi.org/10.31703/gesr.2023\(VIII-II\).37](https://doi.org/10.31703/gesr.2023(VIII-II).37)
- Ramzan, M. Mushtaq, A. & Ashraf, Z. (2023) Evacuation of Difficulties and Challenges for Academic Writing in ESL Learning. University of Chitral Journal of Linguistics & Literature VOL. 7 ISSUE I (2023), 42-49
- Olin, A., Francisco, S., Salo, P., Pörn, M., & Karlberg-Granlund, G. (2020). Collaborative professional learning for changing educational practices. *Pedagogy, education, and praxis in critical times*, 141-162.
- Schnellert, L., & Butler, D. L. (2021). Exploring the potential of collaborative teaching nested within professional learning networks. *Journal of Professional Capital and Community*, 6(2), 99-116.
- Trabona, K., Taylor, M., Klein, E. J., Munakata, M., & Rahman, Z. (2019). Collaborative professional learning: Cultivating science teacher leaders through vertical communities of practice. *Professional development in education*, 45(3), 472-487.
- Wood, K., Jaidin, H., Jawawi, R., Perera, J. S. H. Q., Salleh, S., Shahrill, M., & Sithamparam, S. (2017). How and what teachers learn from collaborative professional development. *International Journal for Lesson and Learning Studies*, 6(2), 151-168.



@ 2023 by the author. Licensee University of Chitral, Journal of Linguistics & Literature, Pakistan. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).